BIBLIOMETRIC ANALYSIS OF INNOVATIVE WORK BEHAVIOR IN INDONESIA

*M. Rizki Pratama1), Ni Putu Febi Wulandari2), Anisa Maharani3)
1), 2), 3) Departemen Administrasi Publik, Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi, Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia

*Email Korespondensi: pratamarizkim@ub.ac.id

Diterima Redaksi: 01-08-2023 | Selesai Revisi: 04-08-2023 | Diterbitkan Online: 06-09-2023

Abstract
This research endeavors to achieve two primary objectives: first, to systematically map extant studies on innovative work behavior, and second, to elucidate emerging trends within these studies, emphasizing the Indonesian milieu. The researcher employed a bibliometric analysis, augmented by the PRISMA protocol, and conducted a comprehensive exploration of the Scopus database. The importance of this study is underscored by the distinctive innovative culture of Indonesia and its relative underrepresentation in global innovation indices. Our analysis of a curated set of 35 articles indicates a pronounced focus, predominantly spanning from 2017 to

Abstrak

Kata Kunci: Bibliometrik; Indonesia; Perilaku Kerja Inovatif;
2023, signaling an upswing in research interest or contributions during this period in Indonesia. The distribution of articles across diverse journals further corroborates the burgeoning relevance of the subject in the Indonesian context. Additionally, key terms such as "Innovative Work Behavior," accompanied by "Knowledge Sharing" and "Job Performance," dominate the discourse, underlining their pivotal role in the research landscape. Moreover, the prevailing inclination towards quantitative research methodologies, in the absence of qualitative ones, creates a methodological void. The disproportionate representation of public and business organizations in the dataset also signifies a population gap, highlighting the need for public administration research to address this gap promptly. Significantly, this study endeavors to bridge the gap in academic literature by referencing globally reputed works on innovative work behavior, with a particular emphasis on the Indonesian context, which has been largely underrepresented in scholarly discussions.

Keywords: Bibliometrix; Indonesia; Innovative Work Behavior

INTRODUCTION

Organizational endeavors to address evolving dynamics invariably intersect with the institution's capability for renewal or innovation, stemming from the creative process, ideation, implementation, and subsequent institutionalization (Baer, 2012; J. De Jong & Den Hartog, 2010; Hjelmar, 2021; Hua et al., 2022; Klein & Knight, 2005). Within this innovative capacity, organizations draw upon multifaceted sources. The "research pull" theory posits that innovation is spurred by research and development findings, while the "market pull" approach emphasizes innovation resulting from market analysis imperatives (Osborne, Stephen P, 1998). Consequently, innovation emerges as a pivotal determinant: organizations' adaptability to change is directly proportional to their resilience in the face of these changes.

Organizations' needs extend beyond tangible assets, such as financial resources and infrastructure; of paramount importance is a human resource poised to adaptively respond to rapid changes through innovative endeavors (Ma Prieto & Pilar Pérez-Santana, 2014). Furthermore, other crucial organizational elements include supportive organizational systems and a culture fostering innovation (Bysted & Jespersen, 2014; J. P. J. De Jong & Den Hartog, 2007; Fernandez & Moldogaziev, 2013; Hogan & Coote, 2014). Within this framework, individuals exhibiting innovative behavior, complemented by organizational systems and cultures conducive to innovation, invariably emerge as organizational requisites.
Focusing on the human aspect, one discerns individuals' rapid adaptative responses to change encapsulated within the Innovative Work Behavior (IWB) paradigm. Such innovative behavior remains a vital determinant of organizational sustainability, both in the short term and longitudinally, spanning both business and public sector contexts, contributing to organizational resilience and peak performance (Bos-Nehles et al., 2017; Bysted & Hansen, 2015; Susanto, 2020; Suseno et al., 2020).

Given the profound implications of innovative work behavior, the primary objective of this research is to delineate studies on this behavior within the Indonesian milieu. Expanding upon this, the research seeks to discern trends and patterns of innovative work behavior studies specific to Indonesia. Previous investigations indicate that the majority of IWB studies are Asian-centric (Srirahayu et al., 2023). Concurrently, Indonesia's innovative capacity remains suboptimal, especially within the Asian ambit, despite experiencing significant strides in innovation indices (Dutta et al., 2022). The Indonesian context warrants inclusion in the global discourse on innovative behavior for various reasons, including a perceived discord between innovative culture, which can engender workplace conflict, and Javanese culture's harmonious ethos (Santoso, 2012). On a global scale, Indonesia's innovation index lags behind its counterparts, particularly within Southeast Asia (Dutta et al., 2022). Compounding this, despite immense potential, policies bolstering innovation in Indonesia remain problematic (Tundang, Ronald & Mercurio, Bryan, 2023).

This research is imperative to map current developments and identify existing gaps necessitating future enhancements. Distinguishing this study from its predecessors is its focus on globally reputed literature related to innovative work behavior within the Indonesian context; to date, no comprehensive study encapsulating innovative work behavior in Indonesia has been discerned by the researchers.

**RESEARCH METHOD**

The researchers employed a systematic literature review using bibliometric analysis to evaluate studies related to innovative work behavior in Indonesia. Bibliometric analysis refers to a methodology designed for the comprehensive
exploration and systematic analysis of extensive scientific datasets (Donthu et al., 2021). Additionally, the PRISMA Checklist was adopted to ensure transparency in data processing. All stages are explained below (see also graph. 1). The final dataset extracted from Scopus database as the primary resources of this analysis could be downloaded at https://s.ub.ac.id/iwb2023.

Eligibility Criteria:

1. **Topic**: The focus was solely on the topic of "Innovative Work Behavior."
2. **Region**: The scope of the research was limited to Indonesia.
3. **Language**: Only articles written in English were considered.
4. **Publication Status**: Only published journal articles were included, excluding proceedings, books, reports, or other types of publications.
5. **Publication Year**: While all publication years were considered, only articles from 2017 to 2023 were found.

Search Strategy:

1. In the first round, the researcher searched the Scopus database using the terms "innovative work behavior" and "Indonesia" in English and found 104 articles. Researchers implement the query: TITLE-ABS-KEY (innovative AND work AND behavior) AND (LIMIT-TO(AFFILCOUNTRY, "Indonesia")) AND (LIMIT-TO(LANGUAGE, "English"))

2. In the second round, the researcher limited the source type to "Journal" and the document type to "article", and set the publication stage to "final", resulting in 84 documents being found. Researchers implement the query: TITLE-ABS-KEY (innovative AND work AND behavior) AND (LIMIT-TO(AFFILCOUNTRY,"Indonesia")) AND (LIMIT-TO(LANGUAGE,"English")) AND (LIMIT-TO(SRCTYPE,"j")) AND (LIMIT-TO(DOCTYPE,"ar")) AND (LIMIT-TO(PUBSTAGE,"final"))

3. In the third round, the researcher narrowed down the subject areas to: "Business, Management and Accounting", "Social Sciences", "Economics, Econometrics
and Finance", "Arts and Humanities", and "Psychology". After applying the keyword "innovative work behavior", 37 documents were found. Researchers implement the query: TITLE-ABS-KEY (innovative AND work AND behavior) AND (LIMIT-TO (AFFILCOUNTRY, "Indonesia") ) AND (LIMIT-TO (LANGUAGE, "English") ) AND (LIMIT-TO (SRCTYPE, "j" )) AND (LIMIT-TO (DOCTYPE, "ar") ) AND (LIMIT-TO (PUBSTAGE, "final") ) AND (LIMIT-TO (SUBJAREA, "BUSI") OR LIMIT-TO (SUBJAREA, "SOCI") OR LIMIT-TO (SUBJAREA, "ECON") OR LIMIT-TO (SUBJAREA, "ARTS") OR LIMIT-TO (SUBJAREA, "PSYC") ) AND (LIMIT-TO (EXACTKEYWORD, "Innovative Work Behavior") )

4. In the end, the researchers selected 35 recorded articles and removed 2 articles because their titles and abstract content did not accurately depict IWB in Indonesia.

**Coding:** The researcher coded the Innovative Work Behavior studies in Indonesia based on the content of the scientific articles, from the title, abstract, key words to the research method. Ultimately, we identified publication trends, source trends, topic streams, research method streams, and organization type streams.

---

Graph 1. The Selection Process
RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Graph 2. Publication Trend

The bar chart illustrates the distribution of the top 35 research articles based on their publication years. The dataset began in 2017, with 3 articles from that year making it to the top 35. In 2019, the number of articles doubled, reaching 6 publications. The momentum continued in 2020, also having 6 articles. However, in 2021, there was a slight decline, with 5 articles published. A significant surge was observed in 2022, with 12 articles published, making it the year with the highest number of articles among the top 35. Finally, in 2023, the number of articles returned to the levels seen in 2017, with 3 articles. The data demonstrates a fluctuating trend in the number of top articles published over the years, with 2022 standing out as a particularly prolific year.

The escalating number of publications on innovative work behavior implies a deeper engagement by the academic community in Indonesia with this subject matter. Moreover, it is possible that policymakers and organizations in Indonesia have realized the significance of fostering a culture of innovation within their institutions to enhance
productivity and remain competitive in an ever-changing global landscape. Consequently, scholars and researchers are keen on investigating the antecedents, determinants, and outcomes of innovative work behavior, aiming to provide evidence-based insights that can guide policy formulation and strategic decision-making. The observed outcomes resonate with the prevailing scholarly consensus, wherein innovative work behavior has garnered substantial attention, culminating in a plethora of articles within the global academic milieu (Srirahayu et al., 2023).

Graph 3. Source Trend

The horizontal bar chart offers a comprehensive breakdown of the top 35 research articles, categorized according to their respective journals. Among the selected publications, "Quality - Access to Success" emerges as the leading journal, contributing a total of 4 articles to the top 35 list. Following closely behind is "Problems and Perspectives in Management," which makes a significant contribution with 3 articles.

Source: Scopus, 2023

This assortment of journals reflects a blend of sources catering to various research areas, exemplifying the multidisciplinary nature of the study of innovative work behavior. It is evident that some journals stand out with a more pronounced representation among the top 35 articles, underscoring their significance in shaping the discourse on innovative work behavior in Indonesia. This diverse range of journals contributes to a comprehensive and well-rounded understanding of the subject matter, drawing from a wide array of academic perspectives and methodologies.

In the domain of public administration research, it becomes evident that the aforementioned list of journals lacks representation from top-tier or high-impact journals in the field. This observation aligns with the assessment made by Scimago (2023), wherein several high-impact journals within the public administration domain are acknowledged (https://www.scimagojr.com/journalrank.php?category=3321).

Regrettably, the list of top 35 research articles includes only the "International Journal of Public Sector Management" from among these prestigious publications. Consequently, this dearth of representation from leading journals may engender various issues, most notably the insufficiency of a global discussion pertaining to public administration matters, specifically concerning innovative work behavior within the public sector in Indonesia.
The word cloud provides a visual representation of the frequency of keywords used by authors in the top 35 articles. Several key observations can be made from the visualization. Firstly, "Innovative Work Behavior" emerges prominently, signifying its centrality as a primary theme within a substantial portion of the articles. This observation suggests that the study of behaviors driving innovation holds significant research interest among scholars. Secondly, "Knowledge Sharing" appears as another dominant term, highlighting the emphasis on information dissemination and collaborative learning within the context of these articles. The prominence of this keyword implies that knowledge sharing may play a crucial role in influencing innovation and overall productivity within organizations. Moreover, "Job Performance" stands out as a prominent keyword, indicating a notable focus on assessing and enhancing job performance, potentially in relation to innovative behaviors or knowledge-sharing practices.

Furthermore, the word cloud reveals additional noteworthy terms, including "Organizational Commitment," "Job Satisfaction," and "Employee Performance." These terms suggest a broader context in which researchers explore factors influencing
employee satisfaction, commitment, and overall workplace performance. Additionally, the visualization showcases several smaller keywords that, though not as dominant as the aforementioned terms, contribute to the rich tapestry of research themes present in these articles. These smaller keywords may pertain to specific case studies, niche research areas, or emerging topics of interest.

Overall, the word cloud serves as a valuable visual summary, highlighting recurrent themes and topics within the dataset. The prominent focus on understanding the drivers of innovative behaviors, job performance, and their interconnectedness in the workplace underscores the significance of these areas of inquiry in the academic discourse.

Notwithstanding the prevailing discourse on innovative work behavior, its conceptualization has been predominantly circumscribed to terminologies within managerialism, encompassing themes such as organizational dynamics, performance metrics, and leadership paradigms. It is imperative to broaden this discourse within the realm of public administration, particularly by integrating cultural dimensions, which hold significant pertinence in the Indonesian context. Furthermore, an exploration into the nexus between legal frameworks and political nuances is paramount, as these elements distinctly influence innovative undertakings within Indonesia’s public sector.
Graph 5. Research Method Stream

Source: Scopus, 2023

The bar chart provides a categorical overview of the research methodologies utilized in the top 35 articles. Notably, the chart reveals an exclusive reliance on quantitative research methods, with all 35 articles adopting this approach. Quantitative research involves the systematic empirical investigation of observable phenomena through statistical, mathematical, or computational techniques. The unanimous adoption of quantitative methods in these articles suggests several possible factors: Firstly, it may imply that the research questions addressed in these articles predominantly seek to understand patterns, relationships, or trends that can be quantified and measured numerically. Secondly, it could indicate that the datasets or contexts explored in these articles are well-suited for quantitative analyses, possibly involving large datasets, surveys, or experiments that generate numerical data. Lastly, the prevalence of quantitative methods might reflect the prevailing preference for evidence-based findings that can be generalized to larger populations, a strength often associated with quantitative research.
In contrast, the chart conspicuously illustrates the absence of qualitative research methods among the top 35 articles. Qualitative research centers on comprehending underlying reasons, opinions, or motivations and typically involves collecting data in non-numerical forms, such as text, interviews, or observations. The lack of representation of qualitative methods could be indicative of various factors: Firstly, the topics or domains explored in the top 35 articles may not align well with the investigative focus of qualitative inquiries. Secondly, there might be a prevailing preference or bias toward quantitative findings in the selection criteria for the "top 35" articles. Lastly, the current research landscape in this particular field might be more inclined toward empirical and numerical analyses, diminishing the representation of qualitative approaches.

The bar chart underscores the overwhelming preference for quantitative methodologies in the selected top 35 articles. While this does not diminish the value of qualitative research, it sheds light on the current trends and preferences within the research domain under examination. Researchers and scholars may benefit from considering the potential implications of these prevailing methodological preferences when designing future studies and contributing to the evolving discourse in this field.

The interpretative paradigm holds a robust underpinning within Indonesian Public Administration. It becomes essential, therefore, to comprehend innovative work behavior through the lens of this interpretative framework. Scholarly inquiries ought to delve into the quotidian manifestations of innovative work behavior, aspects that remain elusive and arguably ineffable to a positivist methodology. Such a dimension underscores a lacuna in the research methodology, necessitating further scholarly exploration in subsequent studies.
The chart provides a comparative analysis of the organization types linked to the research in the top 35 articles, organization type related to the subject of research such as the sample and their occupational, for example employee in business sector or civil servant in public sector. Among the various organizational contexts explored, a significant number of articles are associated with public organizations. Public organizations are entities operating within the public sector, often under governmental control or funding. The prevalence of public organizations in the research suggests several potential reasons: Firstly, the research topics addressed in these articles may hold substantial interest or relevance for governmental bodies, public institutions, or services, indicating a focus on public sector concerns and challenges. Secondly, the articles might delve into understanding or improving processes, behaviors, or outcomes within the
dynamic landscape of the public sector. On the other hand, the category of business organizations also boasts a noteworthy representation in the top 35 articles. Business organizations typically belong to the private sector, driven by profit motives and operating within competitive markets. The significant presence of business organizations signifies a robust interest in research topics that elucidate or enhance business operations, strategies, or outcomes. It also highlights a keen focus on exploring areas such as innovation, knowledge sharing, and performance within the private sector.

The chart illustrates an unbalanced representation of both public and business organizations, indicating that the research topics explored in the top 35 articles bear relevance and applicability across diverse organizational contexts. This unbalanced representation could hamper the multidimensional nature of the research, encompassing insights that may benefit both the public and private sectors. Moreover, it suggests that the selected articles contribute to a comprehensive understanding of innovative work behavior within various organizational settings, facilitating a holistic perspective on the subject matter and its implications for organizational practices and performance. The an unbalanced organization type leads to population gap, the further research must employ the public sector organization rather than business sector organization, the opportunity will enrich the public administration research agenda in innovative work behavior.

CONCLUSION

In the evolving landscape of academic research, the proliferation of literature on innovative work behavior signals a heightened engagement from the Indonesian scholarly community in this specific area. This surge is perhaps a manifestation of a more extensive acknowledgment by policymakers and organizational figureheads of the pressing need to embed an ethos of innovation, thereby bolstering both productivity and competitiveness amid the tumult of the global milieu. Notably, the assortment of journals that has emerged underscores the inherent multidisciplinarity of this research focus. Yet, a discernible lacuna persists in the representation from apex journals within the realm of public administration, thereby potentially constricting the breadth and depth of discourse at a global scale. This narrow lens, predominantly centered on managerial
constructs such as organizational paradigms and leadership tenets, necessitates a more expansive narrative, one that encompasses the rich tapestry of cultural nuances and delves into the intricate dance of legal and political elements, particularly within the public sector. Rooted deeply within the edifice of Indonesian Public Administration is the interpretative paradigm, serving as a touchstone for comprehending innovative work behavior. This approach casts a spotlight on the limitations of positivist methodologies, heralding a clarion call for more encompassing research avenues. The observed imbalances in the current discourse, while offering a holistic comprehension across different organizational ambits, also underscore a palpable research chasm. There is an exigent imperative to pivot the spotlight towards public sector entities, thereby adding more depth and richness to the discourse on innovative work behavior within the broader compass of public administration.

The forthcoming research trajectory in Indonesian Public Administration warrants a profound exploration into the potential of Innovative Work Behavior (IWB). It is imperative that these studies mature and diversify, potentially encompassing extensive empirical work involving thousands of civil servants to address the extant population gap associated with IWB. Furthermore, a deeper interpretative approach is recommended, which would shed light on the nuanced meanings and implications of innovative behaviors within the public sector, thereby addressing the methodological void. The research agenda must also pivot towards strategies for cultivating and sustaining innovative work behavior in the public sector, rather than merely examining its determinants. Cultural considerations hold paramount importance, as they play a pivotal role in both fostering and perpetuating innovative behaviors within the Indonesian public sector.

REFERENCES


